

Hossam Ouf

The Concept of Traditions Authenticity (*ṣiḥḥa*) between Sunni and Twelver Shi'i Hadith during the Second to the Fifth Hijri Centuries

This paper examines how the *ṣiḥḥa* of a tradition was developed, determined, and defined by Sunni and Twelver Shi'i scholars in the period from the second to the fifth Hijri century. Further, the concept of *ṣiḥḥa* will be highlighted in the history of hadith transmission, i.e. whether it was influenced by certain theological, hadith and jurisprudential factors in the period before, during and after the collection of the six Sunni hadith collections (*al-kutub al-sitta*) and the four Shi'i hadith collections (*al-kutub al-arba'a*) between the two groups, and if these factors played a role in the emergence and development of this concept. To understand the concept of *ṣiḥḥa* and its historical development, this paper addresses the following questions: to whom a report should be ascribed in order to be *ṣaḥīḥ*? How is the accuracy of this ascription examined and determined? What conditions were established to confirm or question the *ṣiḥḥa* of a report? Which relationship was developed between the *ṣiḥḥa* and the *'amal* (normative practice) and the *qarīna* (indicator)? What was the relationship between the *ṣiḥḥa* and the authority of a tradition as a source in Islamic theology? Was there a change in the definition of the *ṣiḥḥa* from the second to the fifth century in both Sunni and Shi'i theologies? When did the *ṣiḥḥa* concept emerge as a systematic term in the two hadith sciences? The answers to these questions, which form the basis for the methods of the scholars of both groups, relate to the question of the theological foundations on which the concept of *ṣiḥḥa* was formed in Sunni and Shi'i scholarship. This paper aims to explore the *ṣiḥḥa* concept meanings and whether this concept has changed and shaped. Moreover, it aims to differentiate between the methods of *mutaqaddimīn* and *muta'akhkhirīn* from a Sunni perspective and between *akhbariyyīn* and *uṣūliyyīn* from a Shi'i perspective to identify parallels and differences. Finally, the paper is aiming to conduct a dialogue between Sunni and Shi'i scholarship and to discuss the similarities and differences.



Hossam Ouf

University of Tübingen

Hossam Ouf is currently a research fellow at the Chair of Hadith Studies and Prophetic Tradition at the Center for Islamic Theology in Tübingen, where he researches and teaches Hadith and Sira. He also received his doctorate in 2022 from the University of Tübingen. His dissertation entitled "Hadith Transmission and Confessionality: A Comparative study of "*al-Jāmi' al-ṣaḥīḥ*" of al-Bukhārī (d. 256/870) and "*al-Kāfi*" of al-Kulaynī (d. 329/940) in the Sunni and Twelver Shiite hadith sciences." He completed his master's and bachelor's degree in Islamic Theology in the German language at Al-Azhar University in Cairo, Egypt. His master's thesis was also on the topic "The Hadith Criticism of al-Khaṭṭābī (931-998): An Analytical Study of *Matn* Criticism in the 10th Century A.D./4th Century A.H." His research interests include Islamic Theological Hadith Research, classical and modern approaches to hadith sciences and the hadith transmission, comparative Hadith research, Sunnis, Shiites, Mu'tazilites, Hadith hermeneutics and hadith exegesis, and classical and modern exegetical approaches to *mushkil al-ḥadīth*.