

SCHULTZ, BART, ed. *Essays on Henry Sidgwick*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992. 421 pp. \$65.00 (cloth).

This splendid collection boasts an impressive list of contributors and ably serves to redress the insufficient attention paid to this giant of nineteenth-century British moral philosophy. The major focus, of course, is a critical review of Sidgwick's ethical theory: most notably, his effort to unite utilitarianism and intuitionism and his insistence on the rationality of egoism. Some attention is also directed to Sidgwick's classical studies and to his almost forgotten work in political science.

Many essays herein focus on Sidgwick's famous "duality of practical reason." For Sidgwick, there is no rational harmony between duty and self-interest. To be sure, he acknowledged that this lamentable conclusion could be circumvented by adopting a theological postulate, but Sidgwick himself was unable and unwilling to do so. The driving force of this dilemma is dramatically conveyed in these pages, and with it the need for religious ethics to deal forthrightly with his thought.

CHRISTOPHER BEEM, *Chicago, Illinois*.

JONES, KENNETH W., ed. *Religious Controversy in British India: Dialogues in South Asian Languages*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1992. 293 pp. \$59.50 (cloth); \$19.95 (paper).

These ten case studies of nineteenth-century religious polemics among Christians, Muslims, Sikhs, and Hindus introduce new historical material from the vernaculars. Enhanced by bibliographical essays at the end of each case study, the book opens new pathways for our study of modern India.

Editor Ken Jones and several of the authors stress political significance. The new "lay" religious leaders and their literature established the discourse used in twentieth-century polemical conflicts between nationalist Hindus and the Muslim, Sikh, and Christian minorities.

Barbara Metcalf in her summary discusses the phenomenological issues of "imagining" religions. These leaders and Hinduism itself, she says, were "very much products" of the colonial encounter (pp. 230-31). Many of these polemicists borrowed rhetorical style, use of the print medium, and even some of the issues themselves from the examples set by Protestant missionaries.

I would qualify her assumption that the ideological construction of religious community is exclusively a modern and text-driven phenomenon (p. 230). Similar hermeneutical patterns of syncretic borrowings and nativistic differentiations could be found in older histories of intercultural contacts as well. And mention of interreligious debates in this work suggests that there are ritualistic and oral perspectives worth pursuing.

TIM BRYSON, *Harvard University Center for the Study of World Religions*.

ARMSTRONG, KAREN. *Muhammad: A Biography of the Prophet*. San Francisco: Harper, 1992. 290 pp. \$23.00 (cloth).

In this biography, Karen Armstrong focuses on the religious experience of the Islamic Prophet and his "distinctive and valuable contribution to the spiritual

The Journal of Religion

experience of humanity" (p. 14). Drawing from Ibn Ishaq's (d. ca. 768) *Sirat Rasul Allah*, Armstrong depicts a Prophet whose spirituality was intimately tied to social concerns; Muhammad's views on women, politics, and military expansion were outward manifestations of deep, inner convictions regarding morality, monotheism, and submission. For Armstrong, it was this unique and profound connection between social concerns and religious values that gave Islam its distinctive character.

Muhammad presents a sympathetic portrait of the Prophet that challenges lingering Western prejudices against Islam. In the process of making Muhammad more accessible to the general public, however, Armstrong has ignored some critical source issues. First, she asserts that we can know more about Muhammad than about the founders of other major faiths. Since most biographical materials on the Prophet appeared well after Muhammad's death, the accounts of events of his life are no more pristine than those of Jesus or the Buddha. Second, while her appeal to a common spiritual experience of humanity makes the Prophet more affable to a Western (Christian) audience, it often forces her to project her own religious values onto her subjects. For example, her description of the hajj borders on the romantic when she states that the Arabs "were probably aware, at a deep if inarticulate level, of the symbolic, figurative nature of what they were doing—a state of mind which many of us in the West have lost" (p. 64). All in all, however, Armstrong's effort to undermine Western ignorance and intolerance toward Islam could not have come at a more crucial time.

KATHRYN KUENY, *Chicago, Illinois*.

LOADES, ANN, and RUE, LOYAL D., eds. *Contemporary Classics in Philosophy of Religion*. La Salle, Ill.: Open Court, 1991. xii+603 pp. \$50.00 (cloth); \$20.00 (paper).

This volume collects twenty-seven previously published papers in the philosophy of religion by Anglophone practitioners of the discipline trained within the broadly analytic tradition. The earliest was published in 1964, but the majority have appeared since 1977; hence the book's title. The papers were selected by asking a group of distinguished philosophers of religion (listed on p. xii) to nominate the best articles to have appeared during the last decade and then by choosing from these the pieces that best met the criteria of being comprehensible to advanced undergraduates and of being original contributions to the field. The volume is successful: the essays are of a uniformly high quality and represent splendidly the kind of work now being done in the field. Many of the great names are represented: Alvin Plantinga, William Alston, Richard Swinburne, Alasdair MacIntyre, and so forth. An added feature is the bibliography, which lists all the essays suggested by the nominators, providing a good resource for further work in the field.

PAUL J. GRIFFITHS, *University of Chicago*.

ROTENBERG, MORDECHAI. *Dia-Logo Therapy: Psychonarration and PaRDDeS*. New York: Praeger, 1991. 192 pp. \$45.00 (cloth).

Mordechai Rotenberg, professor of psychology at Hebrew University, creates a lively discourse between narrative, biography, deconstruction, and the Jewish

Copyright of Journal of Religion is the property of University of Chicago Press and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.